



Correction to: The relationship between decentralization and economic growth across regimes

Henry Aray¹ · Luis Pedauga²

Published online: 8 February 2023
© Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2023

Correction to: The Annals of Regional Science
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s00168-022-01187-x>

Unfortunately, in original article, in the Tables 3 and 4, the negative coefficients have the sign in one row and the number in another below and Table 5 has typos since the first three variables in the table are not DM_t but D_t. Please place Tables 3, 4 and 5.

The original article can be found online at <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00168-022-01187-x>.

✉ Henry Aray
haray@ugr.es

Luis Pedauga
luis.pedauga@ec.europa.eu

¹ Department of Economics, University of Granada, Campus de la Cartuja, s.n, E-18071 Granada, Spain

² Joint Research Centre (European Commission) and Department of Economics and Statistics, University of Leon, Campus de Vegazana, s.n., E-24007 Leon, Spain

Table 3 PSTR with an index of TFP as the transition variable

Transition variable	Index of TFP							
	(1)		(2)		(3)		(4)	
Threshold	102.0824		103.2639		103.4499		104.7521	
Gamma	5		20		14		20	
	Low	58%	Low	66%	Low	29%	Low	45%
	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.
D_t	0.0160	0.0103	0.0142	0.0083	0.0235	0.0133*	0.0200	0.0125
D_{t-1}	-0.0099	0.0071	-0.0087	0.0057	-0.0110	0.0093	-0.0126	0.0074
D_{t-2}	-0.0085	0.0036**	-0.0061	0.0033*	-0.0065	0.0054	-0.0063	0.0041
$\Delta \text{Log}(S_{it})$	0.0085	0.0036**	0.0124	0.0020***	0.0174	0.0047***	0.0118	0.0031***
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{pu})$	0.3647	0.0943***	0.1679	0.0706**	0.2657	0.1217**	0.2019	0.0732**
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{hc})$	0.0287	0.0465	0.0160	0.0382	0.0462	0.0664	0.0028	0.0468
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^s)$	-0.0122	0.0122	0.0020	0.0104	0.0098	0.0130	-0.0053	0.0129
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{rd})$	0.1380	0.0377***	0.0892	0.0237***	0.0441	0.0413	0.0954	0.0578
$\Delta \text{Log}(T_{it})$	-0.0013	0.0172	0.0039	0.0119	0.0337	0.0193*	0.0002	0.0135
$\Delta \text{Log}(F_{it})$	0.0140	0.0059**	0.0104	0.0055*	-0.0025	0.0097	0.0045	0.0051
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{pu})$	0.0201	0.0083**	0.0157	0.0069**	0.0507	0.0145***	0.0199	0.0108*
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{eh})$	-0.0016	0.0052	0.0000	0.0040	-0.0064	0.0085	0.0009	0.0068
$\Delta \text{Log}(R_{it})$	-0.0321	0.0297	-0.0262	0.0282	-0.0638	0.0289**	-0.0778	0.0273**
	High	42%	High	34%	High	71%	High	55%
	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.
D_t	0.0040	0.0054	0.0066	0.0057	0.0038	0.0048	0.0049	0.0057
D_{t-1}	-0.0045	0.0077	-0.0043	0.0066	-0.0052	0.0054	-0.0039	0.0058
D_{t-2}	-0.0091	0.0071	-0.0104	0.0051*	-0.0017	0.0034	-0.0021	0.0037
$\Delta \text{Log}(S_{it})$	0.0192	0.0035***	0.0151	0.0033***	0.0084	0.0041*	0.0124	0.0040***
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{pu})$	0.3185	0.0789***	0.1354	0.0459***	0.1657	0.0515***	0.1705	0.0503***
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{hc})$	0.0398	0.0322	0.0235	0.0232	-0.0139	0.0251	0.0001	0.0250
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^s)$	-0.0319	0.0122**	-0.0189	0.0110	-0.0098	0.0088	-0.0060	0.0099
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{rd})$	0.0302	0.0261	-0.0105	0.0171	0.0375	0.0222	0.0296	0.0222
$\Delta \text{Log}(T_{it})$	-0.0122	0.0083	-0.0148	0.0053**	-0.0128	0.0056**	-0.0084	0.0054
$\Delta \text{Log}(F_{it})$	0.0032	0.0059	0.0071	0.0055	0.0047	0.0054	0.0085	0.0059
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{pu})$	0.0032	0.0049	-0.0006	0.0032	0.0033	0.0033	0.0031	0.0040
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{eh})$	-0.0024	0.0023	-0.0020	0.0014	-0.0011	0.0033	-0.0016	0.0032
$\Delta \text{Log}(R_{it})$	-0.0453	0.0336	-0.0266	0.0192	-0.0194	0.0195	-0.0298	0.0199
No. of observations	372		372		372		372	

Table 3 (continued)

	High Coef.	42% S.E.	High Coef.	34% S.E.	High Coef.	71% S.E.	High Coef.	55% S.E.
No. of individuals	17		17		17		17	
R^2	0.4771		0.4127		0.5285		0.4597	
Linearity tests	<i>Statistic</i>	<i>p-value</i>	<i>Statistic</i>	<i>p-value</i>	<i>Statistic</i>	<i>p-value</i>	<i>Statistic</i>	<i>p-value</i>
$H_0: \delta_1 = \dots = \delta_m = 0$	1.8256	0.0026	1.5786	0.0181	2.1647	0.0001	1.5298	0.0257
$H_0: \pi_1 = \pi_2$	19.9701	0.0000	12.6854	0.0000	13.0061	0.0000	13.3317	0.0000

***, **, * Significant at 1%, 5% y 10%, respectively

Table 4 PSTR with the human capital per worker as the transition variable

Transition variable	Humancapitalstockperworker							
	(1)		(2)		(3)		(4)	
Threshold	0.8542		0.8633		0.8185		0.8185	
Gamma	20		19		5		5	
	Low	13%	Low	14%	Low	5%	Low	5%
	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.
D_t	0.0086	0.0042*	0.0154	0.0043***	0.0171	0.0114	0.0152	0.0132
D_{t-1}	- 0.0201	0.0088**	- 0.0193	0.0072**	- 0.0312	0.0158*	- 0.0307	0.0159*
D_{t-2}	-0.0005	0.0065	0.0020	0.0052	-0.0025	0.0131	-0.0038	0.0137
$\Delta \text{Log}(S_{it})$	0.0537	0.0154***	0.0404	0.0134***	0.0743	0.0400*	0.0724	0.0424
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{pu})$	0.3475	0.1534***	0.2065	0.1342	0.1196	0.2111	0.1731	0.2258
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{hc})$	0.2698	0.0856***	0.1141	0.0818	0.0938	0.1509	0.1124	0.1693
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^s)$	-0.0721	0.0422	- 0.0894	0.0363**	- 0.1140	0.0515**	- 0.0934	0.0517*
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^d)$	0.0008	0.0893	-0.0587	0.0864	0.1669	0.1286	0.1561	0.1350
$\Delta \text{Log}(T_{it})$	0.0517	0.0496	0.0442	0.0452	0.0925	0.0761	0.0868	0.0793
$\Delta \text{Log}(F_{it})$	0.0284	0.0254	0.0278	0.0249	0.0207	0.0430	0.0179	0.0416
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{pu})$	0.0211	0.0253	0.0198	0.0234	0.0017	0.0427	0.0003	0.0424
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{eh})$	- 0.0256	0.0073***	- 0.0253	0.0080***	- 0.0594	0.0135***	- 0.0579	0.0134***
$\Delta \text{Log}(R_{it})$	-0.1088	0.0805	-0.0799	0.0635	0.1430	0.1741	0.1073	0.1786
	High	87%	High	86%	High	95%	High	95%
	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.
D_t	0.0118	0.0078	0.0103	0.0079	0.0067	0.0075	0.0069	0.0078

Table 4 (continued)

	High Coef.	87% S.E.	High Coef.	86% S.E.	High Coef.	95% S.E.	High Coef.	95% S.E.
D_{t-1}	-0.0060	0.0069	-0.0051	0.0064	-0.0035	0.0063	-0.0039	0.0064
D_{t-2}	-0.0067	0.0035*	-0.0069	0.0034*	-0.0034	0.0029	-0.0033	0.0029
$\Delta \text{Log}(S_{it})$	0.0122	0.0023***	0.0115	0.0024***	0.0111	0.0026***	0.0112	0.0025***
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{pu})$	0.3871	0.0868***	0.1971	0.0712**	0.2426	0.0552***	0.2351	0.0561***
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{hc})$	0.0206	0.0237	0.0070	0.0188	-0.0092	0.0207	-0.0037	0.0189
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^s)$	-0.0297	0.0135**	-0.0183	0.0126	-0.0095	0.0135	-0.0083	0.0136
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^d)$	0.0536	0.0422	0.0242	0.0346	0.0218	0.0276	0.0243	0.0270
$\Delta \text{Log}(T_{it})$	-0.0006	0.0065	0.0029	0.0053	0.0029	0.0062	0.0024	0.0066
$\Delta \text{Log}(F_{it})$	0.0079	0.0031**	0.0066	0.0027**	0.0084	0.0036**	0.0090	0.0035**
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{pu})$	0.0127	0.0048**	0.0095	0.0043**	0.0113	0.0047**	0.0110	0.0046**
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{eh})$	-0.0021	0.0032	-0.0013	0.0028	-0.0013	0.0032	-0.0016	0.0033
$\Delta \text{Log}(R_{it})$	-0.0390	0.0222*	-0.0354	0.0202*	-0.0482	0.0194**	-0.0486	0.0197**
	388		388		388		388	
	17		17		17		17	
	0.5458		0.4991		0.5011		0.4699	
Linearity tests	<i>Statistic</i>	<i>p-value</i>	<i>Statistic</i>	<i>p-value</i>	<i>Statistic</i>	<i>p-value</i>	<i>Statistic</i>	<i>p-value</i>
$H_0: \delta_1 = \dots = \delta_m = 0$	1.3947	0.0633	1.3199	0.1010	1.4261	0.0515	1.4405	0.0468
$H_0: \pi_1 = \pi_2$	26.0682	0.0000	26.1462	0.0000	18.0798	0.0000	17.0686	0.0000

***, **, * Significant at 1%, 5% y 10%, respectively

Table 5 PSTR with TFP growth calculated from residuals of estimating production functions accounting for public infrastructure

Transition variable	Public infrastructure stock per efficient worker				Index of TFP			
	Cobb–Douglas production function		Translog production function		Cobb–Douglas production function		Translog production function	
	$\Delta\%$ TFP from OLS residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from SF residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from OLS residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from SF residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from OLS residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from SF residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from OLS residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from SF residuals
Threshold	9.3475	9.3475	9.3475	9.3475	102.3753	98.2262	93.3389	93.3389
Gamma	20	20	20	20	20	20	2	2
	Low	83%	Low	83%	Low	60%	Low	36%
	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.	Coef.	S.E.
D_t	0.0045	0.0042	0.0044	0.0043	0.0142	0.0083	0.0412	0.0092
D_{t-1}	-0.0042	0.0037	-0.0049	0.0040	-0.0080	0.0055	-0.0025	0.0071
D_{t-2}	-0.0035	0.0029	-0.0041	0.0028	-0.0073	0.0037*	-0.0062	0.0033**
$\Delta\text{Log}(S_{it})$	0.0112	0.0019***	0.0112	0.0021***	0.0110	0.0025***	0.0282	0.0042
$\Delta\text{Log}(K_{it}^{pu})$	0.2015	0.0557***	0.1358	0.0585**	0.2116	0.0711***	0.8695	0.1042*
$\Delta\text{Log}(K_{it}^{kc})$	0.0029	0.0170	0.0158	0.0179	0.0053	0.0406	-0.1451	0.0388
$\Delta\text{Log}(k_{it}^s)$	-0.0131	0.0142	-0.0150	0.0142	0.0032	0.0101	0.0658	0.0120
$\Delta\text{Log}(k_{it}^{kd})$	0.0340	0.0299	0.0484	0.0312	0.0676	0.0236**	0.2161	0.0305*
$\Delta\text{Log}(T_{it})$	-0.0028	0.0053	-0.0029	0.0056	0.0001	0.0141	0.1986	0.0182
$\Delta\text{Log}(F_{it})$	0.0103	0.0052*	0.0105	0.0053*	0.0116	0.0059*	-0.0067	0.0051
$\Delta\text{Log}(I_{it}^{pu})$	0.0097	0.0037**	0.0114	0.0038***	0.0161	0.0076**	0.1194	0.0088*
$\Delta\text{Log}(I_{it}^{ch})$	-0.0041	0.0025	-0.0048	0.0025*	-0.0003	0.0047	-0.0541	0.0036
$\Delta\text{Log}(R_{it})$	-0.0400	0.0154**	-0.0403	0.0149**	-0.0158	0.0280	-0.1256	0.0222
								0.0824

Table 5 (Continued)

	High Coef.	17% S.E.	High Coef.	17% S.E.	High Coef.	17% S.E.	High Coef.	40% S.E.	High Coef.	64% S.E.	High Coef.	95% S.E.
D_t	0.0840	0.0083***	0.0840	0.0087***	0.0811	0.0090***	0.0076	0.0057	0.0044	0.0048	0.0014	0.0048
D_{t-1}	-0.0481	0.0108***	-0.0506	0.0110***	-0.0550	0.0099***	-0.0036	0.0064	-0.0044	0.0054	-0.0032	0.0057
D_{t-2}	0.0000	0.0063	0.0027	0.0068	-0.0053	0.0056	-0.0092	0.0054	-0.0074	0.0047	-0.0051	0.0031
$\Delta \text{Log}(S_{it})$	0.0194	0.0072**	0.0161	0.0074**	0.0209	0.0068***	0.0152	0.0033***	0.0186	0.0039***	0.0147	0.0028***
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{pu})$	0.0813	0.0765	0.0315	0.0876	0.0252	0.0585	0.1777	0.0475***	0.0950	0.0464*	0.0342	0.0699
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{kc})$	0.0683	0.0837	0.0643	0.0902	0.0339	0.0739	0.0123	0.0222	0.0100	0.0191	0.0308	0.0332
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^s)$	-0.0216	0.0180	-0.0233	0.0163	-0.0438	0.0181**	-0.0131	0.0106	-0.0201	0.0097*	-0.0267	0.0079***
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{rd})$	0.0557	0.0441	0.0844	0.0480*	0.0760	0.0422*	-0.0128	0.0198	0.0218	0.0171	0.0376	0.0266
$\Delta \text{Log}(T_{it})$	0.0625	0.0339*	0.0624	0.0352*	0.0554	0.0364	-0.0143	0.0061**	-0.0136	0.0052**	-0.0157	0.0069**
$\Delta \text{Log}(F_{it})$	0.0101	0.0069	0.0112	0.0070	0.0114	0.0071	0.0062	0.0043	0.0044	0.0054	0.0055	0.0044
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{pu})$	-0.0034	0.0044	0.0002	0.0052	-0.0006	0.0050	-0.0006	0.0029	0.0024	0.0033	0.0013	0.0043
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{eh})$	-0.0008	0.0031	-0.0011	0.0029	-0.0041	0.0039	-0.0016	0.0016	-0.0030	0.0029	0.0000	0.0027
$\Delta \text{Log}(R_{it})$	-0.0334	0.0399	-0.0345	0.0418	-0.0221	0.0341	-0.0376	0.0236	-0.0290	0.0202	-0.0283	0.0177
No. of observations	388		388		388		372		372		372	
No. of individuals	17		17		17		17		17		17	
R^2	0.5677		0.5783		0.5769		0.4177		0.4592		0.5703	
Linearity tests	Statistic	p-value	Statistic	p-value	Statistic	p-value	Statistic	p-value	Statistic	p-value	Statistic	p-value
$H_0: \delta_1 = \dots = \delta_m = 0$	1.9281	0.0040	1.8534	0.0066	2.0504	0.0018	1.4891	0.0342	1.6148	0.0138	1.4643	0.0405
$H_0: \pi_1 = \pi_2$	21.6081	0.0000	24.8087	0.0000	48.3382	0.0000	15.6016	0.0000	148.0603	0.0000	16.9279	0.0000

Table 5 (Continued)

Human capital stock per worker					
Cobb–Douglas production function			Translog production function		
	$\Delta\%$ TFP from OLS residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from SF residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from SF residuals	$\Delta\%$ TFP from SF residuals	
Threshold	0.8185	0.8633	0.9384		
Gamma	3	20	20		
	Low	Low	Low	Low	43%
	Coef.	Coef.	Coef.	Coef.	S.E.
	S.E.	S.E.	S.E.	S.E.	S.E.
D_t	0.0254	0.0107**	0.0150	0.0044***	0.0209
D_{t-1}	-0.0313	0.0150*	-0.0196	0.0071**	-0.0191
D_{t-2}	0.0011	0.0155	0.0025	0.0051	-0.0071
$\Delta\text{Log}(S_{it}^*)$	0.0733	0.0384*	0.0404	0.0136***	0.0205
$\Delta\text{Log}(k_{it}^{pw})$	0.0481	0.3212	0.1893	0.1308	0.2217
$\Delta\text{Log}(k_{it}^{kc})$	0.0787	0.1294	0.1103	0.0834	0.0411
$\Delta\text{Log}(k_{it}^s)$	-0.1703	0.0634**	-0.0858	0.0354**	-0.0225
$\Delta\text{Log}(k_{it}^{rd})$	0.1113	0.1746	-0.0562	0.0865	0.0598
$\Delta\text{Log}(T_{it})$	0.1013	0.0856	0.0435	0.0450	0.0274
$\Delta\text{Log}(F_{it})$	0.0596	0.0397	0.0291	0.0250	0.0107
$\Delta\text{Log}(I_{it}^{pw})$	0.0223	0.0419	0.0214	0.0234	0.0159
$\Delta\text{Log}(I_{it}^{eh})$	-0.0528	0.0159***	-0.0257	0.0080***	-0.0043
$\Delta\text{Log}(R_{it})$	0.0493	0.1374	-0.0861	0.0629	-0.0620
					0.0115*
					0.0102*
					0.0050
					0.0069***
					0.0736***
					0.0457
					0.0107*
					0.0289*
					0.0138*
					0.0097
					0.0086*
					0.0043
					0.0346*

Table 5 (Continued)

	High Coef.	95% S.E.	High Coef.	86% S.E.	High Coef.	57% S.E.
D_t	0.0085	0.0075	0.0103	0.0079	0.0003	0.0042
D_{t-1}	-0.0030	0.0062	-0.0053	0.0065	-0.0009	0.0047
D_{t-2}	-0.0062	0.0034*	-0.0071	0.0034*	-0.0027	0.0038
$\Delta \text{Log}(S_{it})$	0.0114	0.0029***	0.0112	0.0026***	0.0109	0.0028***
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{pu})$	0.2357	0.0645***	0.1615	0.0705**	0.0187	0.0786
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{kc})$	0.0026	0.0190	0.0091	0.0176	0.0160	0.0334
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^s)$	-0.0143	0.0129	-0.0180	0.0122	-0.0240	0.0085**
$\Delta \text{Log}(k_{it}^{rd})$	-0.0059	0.0313	0.0280	0.0353	0.0481	0.0410
$\Delta \text{Log}(T_{it})$	0.0024	0.0056	0.0029	0.0053	-0.0061	0.0081
$\Delta \text{Log}(F_{it})$	0.0071	0.0027**	0.0060	0.0028**	0.0086	0.0040**
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{pu})$	0.0090	0.0044*	0.0110	0.0043**	0.0097	0.0047*
$\Delta \text{Log}(I_{it}^{ch})$	-0.0006	0.0030	-0.0019	0.0029	-0.0061	0.0021***
$\Delta \text{Log}(R_{it})$	-0.0387	0.0214*	-0.0361	0.0206*	-0.0393	0.0295
No. of observations	388		388		388	
No. of individuals	17		17		17	
R^2	0.4948		0.5041		0.5523	
Linearity tests	Statistic	p-value	Statistic	p-value	Statistic	p-value
$H_0: \delta_1 = \dots = \delta_m = 0$	1.3630	0.0775	1.3129	0.1054	1.7980	0.0032
$H_0: \pi_1 = \pi_2$	18.4401	0.0000	28.0182	0.0000	4.2094	0.0040

***, **, * Significant at 1%, 5% y 10%, respectively

The Original Article has been corrected.

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>.

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.